

Todd Family 113: Andrew Todd died 1801 Tazewell County, Virginia
Richard McMurtry
April 2017

Andrew Todd appears for the first time in the public record during the Revolutionary War. In 1778, he took the oath of allegiance in Harford County Maryland and then the next year in 1779 as a young single man appears in the tax lists of York County Pennsylvania. In 1782, he travelled down the valley to Fredericksburg County, Maryland where he married Elizabeth Sipes. In 1783, he appears again in the York County tax lists but as a householder of 2, confirming his married status. We suspect a birth about in or prior to 1757 assuming that he was 21 in 1778 which would make him 25 when he married.

The Mystery of Andrew's Origins (summary: See the end of this essay for in-depth discussion)

There is not a single shred of documentary evidence to tell us where Andrew was born, who his parents were or what the names of his siblings were, if any. However, there are two clues that have given rise to numerous theories about his origins.

Clue#1: There was a Patrick Todd who took the oath of allegiance in Harford Co Maryland in 1778 with Andrew and a Patrick Todd who appears in the York County tax lists in 1781 where Andrew was living. This Patrick moved south to Harford County Maryland about the time that Andrew moved south to Virginia.

Clue#2: The DNA of descendants of Andrew Todd d 1801 is a close match to 11 other Todd families who migrated to America and Canada.

This clue has given rise to numerous theories about which of these families that Andrew might have been closely linked to. Suffice it to say here that Andrew could have been an Irish immigrant; he could have been a member of the Hunterdon Co New Jersey Todd family; he could have been a lost branch of the Mary Todd Lincoln group of Todds who settled in PA and Virginia in the 1750s; he could have been a lost branch of the Todds who settled in Mecklenburg Co NC by 1767. We simply don't know for sure.

Descendants of Andrew Todd d 1801

Getting back to the family of Andrew Todd, it appears that he and Elizabeth began their family in Pennsylvania, based on the 1850 census record for the oldest daughter indicating a Pennsylvania birth. But shortly thereafter the family moved down to Rockingham County Virginia where Andrew appears in the tax lists in 1787. By 1789, he has moved even further south – to Montgomery County Virginia acquiring the land there on Maiden Spring Branch of the Clinch River (south of the present townlet of Liberty and near Morris Knob, a landmark in the area of Maiden Spring) where he lived until his untimely death only 12 years later in 1801. By that time, county creation had shifted the borders such that he was in Russell County for several years then in Tazewell County after its creation in 1799.

Andrew and Elizabeth had 9 or possibly 10 children in the 20 years of their marriage including an infant born in 1800 the year before he died. So Elizabeth was left at Andrew's death with a houseful of young children and a teenage son George and a 20 year old married daughter to take care of the family.

About 1815, the family all packed up and headed out over the mountains. They stopped for a while in Floyd County Kentucky where George's wife Sallie Brooks Todd died in 1815 and where Catherine married Thomas Fleetwood in 1816. By 1817 or 1818, they were headed to Indiana where they settled in Monroe and Lawrence County. Here in Lawrence County, Thomas Todd married Elizabeth Dayton in 1818.

The life of the family in Indiana is vividly described in various publications of Grover Todd and Nancy Todd Weber, e.g. Todds in Early Lawrence and Monroe County, Indiana ; Elizabeth Todd of Lawrence County Indiana: Her Descendants.

One of the mysteries of the Todd family that puzzled family historians for decades was the marriage in 1836 of Robert R Preston Todd to Lavinia/Melvina Todd the daughter of Andrew's son Thomas Todd b 1799 VA and Elizabeth Dayton b 1801 TN. This Preston Todd reported in his military records that he was born in Russell Co VA, about 1817. Family historians report that this Preston Todd was a cousin, but no one in the later generations knew who his mother and father were. Finally, in 2017, DNA revealed that Preston Todd was the son of one of the Horton family males of Russell Co who lived within 10 miles of the Todds in Tazewell County. This Horton family had a very tumultuous history – with Daniel Horton b 1774 suing his uncle John Horton b 1749 over a land dispute and with Lewis Horton, Daniel's brother, getting shot in the back by Abner Vance after Lewis absconded with Abner's daughter and reportedly brought her back and "dumped" back into the custody of her father. Abner was hung for the murder of Lewis after three trials.

We do not know if Preston was the son of a Todd daughter of Andrew's or whether he was adopted into the family. We don't know if went with the Todds as an infant into Indiana and was raised by the Todds as a Todd. Or whether he moved later as a young adult and joined the Todds. But in any event, he was close enough to them, that he married Lavinia in 1836.

Below is a table of the Todd children compiled by another family historian with a few edits of mine to correct the years of birth based on census records, tax lists and deductive reasoning.

Mary "Polly" Todd	b. 3 Jun 1781 Pennsylvania	d. 10 Dec 1856 Hendricks Co., IN	m. John Pritchett 1795 VA (1782 PA d. 4 Aug 1859 Union, IN)
George Todd	Abt 1785 (age 16- 25 in 1810)	d. 5 Aug 1830 Monroe, Polk Co. IN	m. 1807, Tazewell Co, VA to Sarah "Sallie" Brooks (b. 10 Mar 1783 Tazewell, VA d. 1815 Floyd, KY.)
Elizabeth	b. 11 July 1790	d. 24 Mar 1856	m. William Field Newton 20 Aug

"Betsy" Todd		Wright, MO	1805(b 5 Mar 1783 VA d. 25 Dec 1860 Wright, MO)
William Todd	b. abt 1792 appears in 1813 tax list	d. abt 1845 Indiana	m. Mary "Polly" Dayton (b. abt 1805 TN d. abt 1860)
Nancy Todd	b. abt 1795 Virginia	d. abt 1860 Monroe, IN	m. William Jones 16 Mar 1809 Taz., VA(b. 1780 d. 1850 Lawrence, IN)
Sarah Todd	b. abt 1797 Virginia	d. 1844	m. John Fleetweed 20 Jun 1814 Jackson, IN (b. 1790 salt Crk, Jackson, IN d. 1840 Monroe, IN)
James Todd	b. 1797 Virginia	d. abt 1840	m. Sally Dayton 27 Dec 1823 (b. abt 1803 TN d. abt 1840) ?m. Mary Cardwell
Thomas "Thomps" Todd	b. abt 1799 Virginia	abt 1845 Ozark, MO	m. Esther Easter Dayton 17 Dec 1818 Lawrence, IN (b. 1801 TN d. abt 1840 IN)
Catherine "Caty" Todd	b. 1800 Virginia	b. 1850 IN	m. Thomas Fleetwood 2 Sep 1816 Prestonburg, Floyd, KY (b. 1795 Loudon, VA d. 1851 Polk, IN)

Family historians interested in this family should consult the publications of Nancie Todd Weber because she has pulled together much of the documentary evidence and the family lore that has been passed down through the generations.

The Mystery of Andrew's Origins (in depth discussion)

As mentioned above, there is not a single shed of documentary evidence to tell us where Andrew was born, who his parents were or what the names of his siblings were, if any. However, there are two clues that have given rise to numerous theories about his origins.

Clue#1: There was a Patrick Todd who took the oath of allegiance in Harford Co Maryland in 1778 and a Patrick Todd who appears in the York County tax lists in 1781. This Patrick moved south to Harford County Maryland about the time that Andrew moved south to Virginia.

Since the name Patrick does not appear as a given name in any of the Todd families in early America except in the person of a Patrick Todd b 1768 in Ireland who migrated to South Carolina around 1798, this clue has given rise to the theory that Andrew and Patrick were brothers who migrated to America from Ireland. No descendants of Patrick have been found after about 1820 so there has been no way to use DNA to prove this connection.

Clue#2: The DNA of descendants of Andrew Todd d 1801 is a close match to 11 other Todd families who migrated to America and Canada.

This clue has given rise to numerous theories about which of these families that Andrew might have been closely linked to.

Theory 1: That Andrew Todd b abt 1756-1758 died 1801 was born in Hunterdon Co and was close kin to the Hunterdon County New Jersey Todds.

This theory is supported by the fact that the descendants of Andrew Todd d 1801 have the identical DNA pattern as the family of David Todd 1731-1809, John Todd 1729-1802, and a John Todd 1755-1820. This John Todd married a daughter of David Todd d 1809; John Todd d 1802 did not mention a son John in his will. This suggests that John Todd 1755-1820 was the son of an unknown brother of David and John and that there were probably other brothers. Andrew born 1756-1758 would be the right age to have been one of those brothers. An attempt was made to use a type of DNA test that is useful for showing kinship at the 4th and 5th cousin level by testing DNA samples from two descendants of Andrew Todd and two descendants of John Todd 1755-1820. We found ideal candidates from Andrew d 1801 to test; they had three different lineages all going back to Andrew Todd d 1801 and so had more Todd DNA than descendants with only one lineage going back to Andrew d 1801. However, we could not find such ideal candidates in the descendants of John Todd 1755-1820. So the results did not show a match; but we consider these results non-conclusive about whether Andrew d 1801 was part of the family of John Todd 1755-1820. But we must admit that this data did not support the theory.

Theory #2: That Andrew Todd d 1801 is a lost branch of the family of William Todd who moved to Augusta County Virginia in 1750.

The DNA of the descendants of Andrew d 1801 is very similar, but not identical, to the family of William and his close kin, Robert Todd 1697-1775 Philadelphia County, Pennsylvania (ancestor of Mary Todd Lincoln) and Andrew Todd d1791 Louisa Co Virginia. Though the descendants of these three Todds are well defined, there is one loose end. William Todd had son William baptized in 1738 in Abingdon Presbyterian Church in Philadelphia County. Father William Todd sold his Augusta County land to his son Samuel and moved from Augusta County to Bedford County Virginia in 1760 when he bought 400 acres of land on Turnip Creek near the Bedford/Charlotte County line. There is no record of his selling the land and no record of a will deeding the land to his next of kin. However, the land was sold and it was not sold by William. Instead, it was divided in half – with half being sold in 1770 by a William Todd of “Augusta County” with John Todd as witness and the other half being sold by John Todd and wife Mary in 1772. This William is probably the William Todd b 1738 and identifying him as living in Augusta County suggests that he had moved back to the place where he had been raised as a teenager and young adult.

In 1778, there is a William Todd and a John Todd on the tax lists of Rockbridge County (which was created in 1778 from land that was once in Augusta County). The William “of Augusta” referred to in the 1770 sale might be the William Todd in the 1778 tax records and the John of the 1772 sale might be

the John Todd of 1778 tax record. John and William do not appear on tax lists in the 1780s in the area. John moved to Kentucky with the McMurtrys in the 1780s and William disappeared.

There is a William Todd in Knox Co TN (where lived part of the family of Low Todd 1723-1795, son of William Todd Sr) getting a public tavern license in 1801. If this were William Todd Jr, he would have been about 63 years old. The identity of this Knox Co William is unknown though it is tempting to assume this is William Todd Jr. No record of any descendants has been found, but some historians believe that this William b 1738 was the father of Andrew Todd b 1756-1758 d 1801 and that Andrew moved to Pennsylvania around the time that William moved back to Rockbridge County.

Theory 3: That Andrew d 1801 was somehow connected to the John Todd who migrated to Mecklenburg County North Carolina by 1767.

The DNA of descendants of Andrew Todd is only 1 marker different from the family of the Mecklenburg Co Todds and the Mecklenburg Todd DNA is 2 markers different from the Mary Todd Lincoln group of Todds.

This would suggest that John Todd d 1799 of the Mecklenburg Todds was not a brother or first cousin to the Mary Todd Lincoln Todds, but could have been more distant kin. Keep in mind that when William Todd of the Mary Todd Lincoln group of Todds was baptizing his children at the Abingdon Presbyterian Church in the 15 years between 1723 and 1738, there was a John Todd who married at this church in 1724 and also had children baptized there in the 11 years between 1725 and 1736. Also, Robert Todd 1697-1775 had a son David married there in 1749. Furthermore, the New Jersey Supreme Court records for Bethlehem Township, Hunterdon County (which lay across the Delaware River from Philadelphia County) include William, John and Robert Todd: William in 1745/46; Robert in 1753-1755; John in 1738, 1743, 1748, 1757. We believe these to be records of the William and John of the Abingdon Church. We also believe that this William is the William who migrated to Augusta Co VA in 1750 because he went there with his son Low Todd who was baptized at Abingdon Church in 1723. We believe this Robert to be the Robert 1697-1775 who shows up in Chester County in 1755. We believe this John to be the John Todd who shows up in Mecklenburg County, NC in 1767 and dies there in 1799 based on the names of his oldest children matching the names of the children of John at Abingdon Church.

All this detail is just trying to show the geography of John Todd's movements are compatible with the theory of an Andrew Todd being somehow related to John. However, since Andrew would have been about 9 to 11 years old when John moved to Mecklenburg County, it seems unlikely that he would have moved back north to Pennsylvania by 1779. So this brings us back to the theory that the Hunterdon Co Todds were close kin to John and that Andrew fit into the Hunterdon County Todds as a brother to John Todd 1755-1820.

Theory 4: That Andrew Todd d 1801 was an Irish immigrant.

We have discussed this above. This possibility can not be ruled out.

Conclusion About Origins

My intuition is that Andrew d 1801 was part of the Hunterdon County Todds. I based this on the identical nature of the male DNA patterns of the two families and the well documented migrations of other families from New Jersey into the valley land of Pennsylvania of which York County was a part. The only way to prove this is to get numerous descendants of John Todd 1755-1820 to submit a DNA sample for analysis in the hopes that one of them would have a higher proportion of Todd DNA in their cells than the average and thereby show a match with the Todd DNA of the Andrew d 1801 family. We were unable to find ideal candidates for testing of the Hunterdon County Todds in 2016. In a few years, all the remotely suitable candidates will have died.

I will also admit that the DNA could be interpreted to imply that these four groups of Todds (Mary Todd Lincoln, Hunterdon County, Mecklenburg Co, Andrew Todd) had their connection way back in Ireland. The DNA pattern of the descendants of Andrew d 1801 is also shared by the descendants of James Todd 1774-1838 who lived in Quebec in the early 1800s. The DNA pattern of the Mecklenburg Todds is shared by two families that live today in County Derry, Northern Ireland.

It is tempting to think that James Todd b 1774 of Quebec could be an offshoot of the Hunterdon Co Todds and close kin to Andrew d 1801. It might be worthwhile to get some DNA samples from the Quebec family. Unfortunately, the DNA donor for that family is too many generations removed from a possible common ancestor for the autosomal DNA test to be conclusive. So this would be a major research effort.